

Independent Completion Assessment Report: Citizens Against Corruption Programme

Youth for Social Development, Orissa

Prepared By:



A Global Initiative on Citizenship and Democracy

Title of Project	Enabling Citizen Monitoring of Public Services, Preventing Bribery to Foster Effective Service Delivery in Brahmapur city of Orissa	
Project Location: Brahmapur, Ganjam, Orissa		
Corruption Problem being addressed: (as described in the project proposal).		
<p>The Urban Corruption Survey conducted YSD, resulted in mapping the magnitude of retail/petty corruption in basic public service delivery in Berhampur city based on the views of the households. The major findings of the survey reveal that most of the citizens (82%) were required to pay a bribe to obtain basic public services. BDA (Berhampur Development Authority) and Land Record and Administration (Tehsil and Sub-registrar) services were rated the most corrupt institutions in Berhampur city with 51.44 and 40.65 bribery index respectively. This followed by Public Distribution System and Drinking Water with 35.37 and 33.70 bribery index respectively while the overall bribery index remains at 36.52 out of a maximum score of 100. It is evident from the study that the common citizens pay a bribe of Rupees 57.73 million while availing basic public services. Almost all the service agencies are poor in delivering procedural information to access different services except Public Health Care. Fear of harassment and delay in service delivery remains two important reasons for paying bribe. Among the other reasons unavailability of procedural information and the difficult application procedure compels the citizens to pay bribe. The overall citizen satisfaction with the service agencies remains poor in almost all services.</p> <p>Corruption in public service delivery is mostly due to the lack of information regarding the procedure to access different services and the service agencies are weak in delivering this information to the general public. The irresponsible and unaccountable behavior of public officials and increasing incidents of demanding bribe are some of the other reasons for corruption in public institutions. It has been found within the six service agencies (PHED, BMC, BDA, CSD, HD and RD) the demand for information by the citizen's is very low and reporting to corrupt practices almost nil. This is due to the fact that people do not have the awareness regarding the Right to Information (specifically that it fights corruption and evidences the corrupt practice so that they can act upon the fraud) and also lacking the technical knowledge to file an RTI application. Reporting corruption and demanding information is complicated, time consuming and weak response from the public institutions side. So it can be concluded that there is poor citizen participation in demanding transparency and governance from citizen's part and at the same time the weak response from the public official's part to deliver better services.</p>		
	<i>Planned</i>	<i>Actual</i>
Implementation period	30 th September 2009 to 15 th March 2011	30 th September 2009 to 15 th March 2011
Total Budget (for one year)	US \$ 31,850(Thirty one hundred eight fifty dollars)	
PTF Contribution		

<u>Project Objectives</u>	
<u>As described at Project Approval (for two years)</u>	<u>Status of Achievement at Completion¹</u> (in view of the Evaluator)
1. To promote citizen groups and civil society monitoring of basic services delivery (i.e. water supply, public distribution system and land record & administration) with set of monitoring check list;	2
2. To build capacity of the citizen groups, civil society on monitoring service delivery by utilizing right to information and to act upon those information to fight corruption/bribery.	3
3. To advocate for proactive disclosure of information, provision of grievance redressal and institutional reforms for reduction in bribe/petty corruption ensuring transparency and accountability	3
Executive Summary: (as mentioned in the project completion report)	
Top Three Results (actual). In view of the Evaluator)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Excellent Documentation and publication of IEC material ➤ Better Coordination with other stakeholders like PDS dealers, Govt. officials including community. ➤ Active participation of Women
Overall Achievement Rating² in Evaluators view. Use numeric rating as well as narrative. See footnote 2.	2

Commentary to support overall assessment

Guidance. Please provide a narrative to accompany your overall achievement rating taking into account your overall assessment (in a maximum of 20 lines) of taking into account quality or project design, implementation performance and results achieved. Reasons for rating of 4 or more may please be explained here. It is suggested that this be written last after the detailed assessment (Section 2 below) has been done and Overall Achievement Rating determined.

The project team of YSD has done admirable work under the projects 'Enabling Citizen Monitoring of Public Services' and 'Preventing Bribery to Foster Effective Service Delivery in Brahmapur city of Orissa'. The Project team magnificently

¹ Please use the following ratings scale and provide brief narrative. 1 = fully achieved, very few or no shortcomings; 2 = largely achieved, despite a few short-coming; 3 = only partially achieved, benefits and shortcomings finely balanced; 4 = very limited achievement, extensive shortcomings; 5 = not achieved.

² The degree to which the project achieved, or seems likely to achieve, all or most of its objectives and produced the outcomes projected in the logframe attached to the Project Proposal. The rating be based on, and consistent with, the detailed ratings in the Completion Assessment section.

documented all the processes of the project. Apart from this, they have also published IEC material like quarterly newsletters under the CAC programme and toolkit on proactive information disclosure on RTI.

YSD has already done an Urban Corruption Survey, which is based on the citizen's perspective on bribery/petty corruption prevailing in various public service agencies with the support of PTF. This intervention has not only supported the current intervention under CAC project but also created a base for its effective implementation.

During the field visit it was gathered that the Social Watch Group formed under the project has taken up numerous initiatives for addressing corruption issues in PDS, water supply services and functioning of the land department. The project has been successful in declaring one 'model PDS shop' as the quality and quantity of grains/food items in this shop are adequately maintained, the list of beneficiaries covered by the shop are enlisted, all the available information regarding PDS is also written on a board and the shop also has an electronic weighing machine. Apart from this, the community monitors also monitor the shop regularly to ensure that no corrupt practices take place.

Apart from corruption issues in PDS, the project is also focusing on water and land development issues. The problems mostly relate to water supply and tenant rights. Interaction with the community of Raghupatinath Nagar slum revealed that after using RTI as a tool for enquiring about piped water supply in their slum area, immediate action was taken by the related department and two taps were installed. This shows that the community monitors including active members of community were able to file an RTI application and facilitate the process of reducing corruption.

Completion Assessment³

1. Quality of the Project Design

- | | |
|---|---|
| a. Elaboration of the corruption problems to be addressed. | 2 |
| b. Clarity and relevance of the objectives to the corruption problem being addressed. | 3 |
| c. Proposed Community empowerment activities | 2 |
| d. Coherence of Results Framework (Logframe) | 2 |
| e. Constructive engagement plan | 2 |

³ Ratings Scale: 1 = Highly Satisfactory or Likely; 2 = Satisfactory/Likely ; 3 = Moderately Satisfactory/Likely; 4 = Moderately unsatisfactory/Unlikely; 5 = Unsatisfactory/Unlikely; 6 = Highly Unsatisfactory/Unlikely; NA = Not Applicable

Comments: (to support/explain rating and overall assessment)

- Elaborated corruption problems are related to bribery in basic public service delivery, which has been shown by coding bribery index in these services. Since project emphasized on water supply, public distribution system and land record & administration, some specific corruption problems related to these issues also need to be incorporated.
- The objectives are not precise and quantifiable, specifically objective 2 and 3 are too ambitious to achieve in the duration of the project. For example objective 2, talks about building the capacity of citizens' groups and civil society, but it does not specify the no. of groups/organizations to be capacitated. Similarly objective 3 aims towards advocating anti-corruption measures but does not clarify the level of governance institutions to engage with.
- The proposed community empowerment activities are quite comprehensive with justifications and assumptions at the end of each activity. These range from that of community mobilization, capacity building and training to that of community empowerment through the use of monitoring tools by the citizens groups.
- YSD has been working in close cooperation with the public officials in Brahmapur and network of CSOs. Constructive engagement plan also includes the names of respective officials associated with different departments and working closely with YSD in the movement against corruption. However, it was also observed that under constructive engagement there was no mention of creating linkages and ties with the local media/newspapers etc.

2. The Implementation Performance

- a. Extent to which the planned project activities completed
- b. Extent to which the planned outputs completed.
- c. Community empowerment initiatives implemented
- d. Constructive engagement during implementation
- e. Focus on sustainability

2

2

3

2

2

Comments:

- The duration of the project is 18 months (September 09 to March 11), however the implementation performance is rated on the basis of the activities planned and implemented up to 20th January 2011. As per the report of the

4th quarter and field visit, most the activities have been completed as per the plan. This can be attributed to the dedication and commitment of the project staff towards the completion of the project activities. However, there is one major activity i.e. an endline survey that would be done at the end of the project. Based on the activities the outputs have also been achieved as per the plan.

- As far as the community empowerment activities are concerned, it was felt that the project team emphasized to train only groups of citizens for monitoring and using RTI for addressing corruption issues rather than mobilizing all the citizens of the target area. This was also reflected during the interaction with the community as except the active members of the monitoring committee, rest of the members were not even aware of RTI and other project initiatives.
- During phase 1 of the CAC programme, YSD has already build linkages with the concerned govt. officials, CSOs and other service providers, which would further support their constructive engagement initiatives in the forthcoming interventions. However, engagement with elected representatives and media has not been undertaken during the project, which is also very important have the support of all stakeholders.

3. The Results: (in the First year)

a. Accomplishments of the results specified in the logframe	2
b. Responsiveness of authorities to constructive engagement.	2
c. Effectiveness of community empowerment initiatives	3
d. Value added of peer learning activities and events.	2
e. Project contribution to CSO partner capacity to carry out anti-corruption work.	2
f. Prospects for sustainability of project activities	3

Comments: (Please briefly explain the ratings and any noteworthy aspects)

- YSD has done a commendable job in terms of constructive engagement with government officials and departments. Involvement of line department officers (land record and administration, water supply, civil supply) including the vice president of PDS shop owners' associations in the project activities reveals their positive approach towards anti-corruption issues. The interaction with the Vice President of PDS shop owner's association revealed that a lot of hard work and sincere efforts had been put in by the team to sensitize and create awareness among the govt. officials. The reports suggest that other

officials also have a positive attitude towards the project activities and initiatives.

- With regard to the results of community empowerment activities, it can be said that in general the awareness of the community with reference to corruption issues and their participation in raising their voice against it has enhanced. However, awareness levels vary from one community to another and also among men and women. In the interaction with community it came out that with the support of YSD, they have not only been able to file RTI applications but also get positive responses from the govt. departments save a few cases, which are still pending. Apart from this, as mentioned earlier, it was felt that though the community is aware of issues and challenges, they still were not vocal enough to raise their voices. More strategic community empowerment activities need to be planned in order to empower the communities in the true sense.
- Sustainability of the project in totality needs to be focused strategically for all the project intervention areas/locations. During the visit it was found that there is a major difference between no. of households in the all the four slums whereas the no. of Citizen Monitoring Committees is the same for each area. For e.g. one Citizen Monitoring Committee was formed in a locality called Raghupatinagar which has 35 households and in another locality called Pandavnagar also just one such committee was formed although it housed 250 families. The impact of project was more visible in the Raghupatinagar Slum rather than Pandavnagar Slums, which directly relates to the sustainability of the project interventions.

4. Impact of the project on reduction in corruption

Impact of the project may be revealed from constructive engagement of stakeholders like Govt. officials, PDS shop owners and community leaders to address corruption in PDS, water and land related issues. However, there is a long way to go for a visible impact of citizen engagement to address and reduce corruption.

Under the project, community leaders and members of monitoring committee are the key persons to deal with corruption issues and they are doing some exemplary work to improve the present scenario. Their potential, dedication and commitment can be further utilized for mobilizing other community members and making them aware of such nuances as well as raising their voice against corruption.

5. PAC-PTF Advice (Please consult CSO Partner)

- a. Value added of PTF technical advice
- b. Value added of PAC technical advice

Comments: *(In your comments please include Strong and weakest points of PTF-PAC interventions and suggestions for improvement)*

The YSD project team shared that they got full support from PAC whenever they required it on technical and other relevant issues.

Strong Points:

- Regular guidance is received from PAC to understand the purpose and the relevance of the project. PAC members have visited the project locations and provided their valuable suggestions from time to time.

Weak Points:

- Limited provisions for building capacity of the project staff specially the field staff.
- Lack of facilitating networking with all the partners in Orissa under CAC programme.

Suggestions from Project team of YSD:

- Peer learning of active community members from different communities within the project area as well as other project area of partner organizations working under CAC should be incorporated in the proposal for motivating these members and their exposure for anticorruption issues.
- Exposure visits of the CSOs in Orissa should be organized to identify other effective anti-corruption practices and methods so that the relevant practices may be applied in their project area to reduce corruption.
- PAC should impart training of the Core Project Staff of all the partner CSOs under CAC Programme before the implementation of the project.